

SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH

COLUMBUS CITY SCHOOLS

FINAL REPORT

TO

BOARD OF EDUCATION

SEPTEMBER 5, 2018

CONSULTANTS:
DR. DEBRA A. HILL
DR. KEVIN CASTNER
DR. PAUL MCKENDRICK



872 S. Milwaukee Avenue, #221
Libertyville, IL 60048

Superintendent Search Columbus City Schools Columbus, Ohio

Consultants' Report

This report presents the results of BWP & Associates' search for candidates for the position of Superintendent of Schools in Columbus City Schools and contains information to assist the Board in completing the search process.

Shortly after the Board's June 11, 2018 appointment of BWP & Associates, we began the initial phase of the search process. Between June 18 and July 21 2018, community engagement activities were conducted to gather quantitative and qualitative data validating the Leadership Profile that had been previously developed and approved by the Board in the fall of 2017. These discussions were also designed to provide the community and public with an update on the search process and progress.

The Community Engagement Report was presented to the Board of Education on July 31, 2018. Overall, there were approximately 24 community members attending focus group sessions, 29 individuals who completed the survey, and more than 600 viewers to a Facebook Live Chat. In general, a large percentage of participants agree to strongly agree with the elements and components of the Leadership Profile.

Vacancy postings and ads were listed on the BWP national website, CCS website, submitted to four educational institutions, distributed at a major educational conference, mailed or e-mailed to educational professionals, and sent to potential applicants by request. A unique link for the search was established on the District website and provided access to search documents which included two progress updates that were submitted to the Board.

As per BWP policy as a private entity and in keeping with the Letter of Understanding with the Columbus City School Board, information about the applicants was kept confidential and is the property of BWP until such time as their names and information are presented as potential candidates to the Board. This procedure also serves to protect the applicants' information and not place their current employment status in jeopardy should they choose not to apply, not meet the Leadership Profile criteria or choose not to pursue the position.

The pre-established protocol, agreed to by the Board, indicated that if successful interviews were completed and the consultants felt that these applicants met the Leadership Profile at an 85% or more level, they would recommend a slate of 4-6 possible candidates for Board consideration on September 5, 2018. If the consultants did not feel the pool yielded qualified candidates, they would recommend that the search application deadline be extended and continued and that the search calendar be modified and adjusted. The search would then continue until a finalist was identified and selected.

Within the search process there were over thirty-five applicants who inquired or were contacted by the consultants regarding this position. By the August 11 deadline there were twenty-seven (27) applicants, however two (2) subsequently withdrew their applications. Eighteen (18) had complete on-line applications and seven (7) did not complete the process. A breakout of the demographic data including positions held by the eighteen (18) applicants, the states from which they applied, highest levels of education and gender is attached (Appendix A) and demonstrates the diversity of the applicant pool.

Drs. Debra Hill, Kevin Castner and Paul McKendrick reviewed applicants' on-line information independently and collectively. Upon review, a number of candidates were identified for further screening and examination. Screening interviews were conducted August 17 – 19 via Zoom, a telecommunications application. Appendix B provides an example of the interview questions employed to determine how closely applicants matched the leadership profile.

In order to reassure the Board that there were viable candidates who met the Leadership Profile criteria, and to adhere to the Letter of Understanding regarding development of a slate, the names of six (6) highly qualified persons were recommend to the Board for their consideration on August 21, 2018. These persons, in our professional judgment, best meet the leadership characteristics and criteria published by the Columbus City School Board in the vacancy announcement and were best matches to the Leadership Profile. Using a triangulation process, we based our opinions on their application information, interview, and initial reference checks. We received authorization to complete our reference checks and prepare a more complete summary of this slate of candidates to be presented on September 5, 2018 for Board consideration and further action. On August 30, 2018, one candidate withdrew from the proposed slate, thus 5 candidates will be presented.

Debra Hill, Kevin Castner, and Paul McKendrick will discuss the recommended candidates with the Board on September 5, 2018. The Board will be provided with Candidate Facts (a comparative data table) which provides demographics relative to the search and the proposed slate identifying the candidates in alphabetical order. To assist the Board in the selection process, Protocols for Interviews and Other Phases of the Search Process have been provided and will be reviewed through Board Training on September 5, 2018. This includes a process for further community input.

The candidate listing has not been rank ordered. A summary document for each of the candidates will be presented and provided to the Board to further assist members in identifying and selecting candidates for further interviews. Once the slate is reviewed and candidates are identified for interviews by the full Board, the Board will receive electronic access to the candidates' files in preparation for interviews and further discussion.

Respectfully submitted,
Dr. Debra Hill, BWP & Associates, Ltd.

**Superintendent Search
Columbus City Schools
Columbus, Ohio**

Appendix A

Applicant Demographics (18)

Positions held currently by the 18 Applicants:

Superintendent	9
Area Superintendent	2
Assistant Superintendent	2
Deputy Superintendent	1
Chief Executive Officer	1
VP of an Educational Foundation	1
Director of Student Mentoring	1
Principal	1

States from which applicants applied (10 states):

Connecticut	1	Ohio	7
Illinois	1	Oklahoma	1
Kansas	1	Tennessee	1
Maryland	1	Texas	1
North Carolina	1	Virginia	3

Years of Experience as Administrators

5 - 13 years	7
14 - 22 years	8
23 - 43 years	3

Highest Size of Student Populations

500 – 15,000	6
16,000 – 60,000	8
61,000 – 400,000	4

Gender of Applicants

Female	6
Male	12

Applicants Degrees

Masters	5
Doctorate	13

SUPERINTENDENT SEARCH
Columbus City Schools - Columbus, Ohio

Candidate Slate as of 9.5.18

Name	Current Position	Location	Years in Position	Previous Positions	Degree/Education
Mr. Terry Dade	Assistant/Area Superintendent	Fairfax County Public Schools Region 3 Falls Church, Virginia 37,000 students	2 years	Executive Principal for School Improvement Principal 10 years in administration 180,000 students	M.A. in School Administration – Trinity University Ed.D. 5/19* – Ed. Leadership & Policy Virginia Tech University
Dr. Talisa Dixon	Superintendent	Cleveland Heights-University Heights Cleveland, Ohio 5,500 students	3 years	Deputy Superintendent Principal 22 years in administration 56,000 students	Ed.D. – Ed. Administration University of Akron
Dr. Ava Tasker-Mitchell	Assistant Superintendent/ Instructional Director	Prince George’s County Public School Mitchellville, Maryland 124,000 students	3 years	Executive Director of Teaching & Learning Assistant Superintendent 10 years in administration 124,000 students	Ph.D. – Organizational Leadership University of Maryland
Dr. Jason Strickland	Deputy Superintendent	Kansas City Public Schools Kansas City, KS 22,000 students	1 year	Assistant Superintendent of Secondary Schools Assistant Superintendent of Teaching and Learning 18 years in administration 22,000 students	Ed. D – Educational Administration University of Missouri
Dr. John Stanford	Interim Superintendent	Columbus City Schools Columbus, Ohio 52,000 students	7 months	Deputy Superintendent Chief Operating Officer	Ph.D. – Public Policy Ohio State University

**Superintendent Search
Columbus City Schools
Columbus, Ohio**

Appendix B

BWP Interview Protocol & Questions

Columbus City Schools - BWP Interview Protocol and Interview Questions

Protocol:

- The interviews will be conducted via Zoom and should last no more than 55 minutes with 10 minutes at the end for the applicant to ask questions.
- Each of us will briefly introduce ourselves: Kevin, Paul, Deb.
- Deb will ask the candidate to give a brief and concise review of their history and tell why they are interested in the position.
- Alternate questions - everyone is asked the same questions.
- We can ask probing or follow up questions but need to remain conscious of the time.
- Deb will provide the next steps, i.e. notification of status (either moving forward or not) within the next 24 hours, review confidentiality provision, provide information about Board interview schedule and prospective dates.
- We will reserve the last 10 minutes for 1 or 2 questions from the applicant that any of us can try to answer.
- Kevin will thank them for the opportunity to interview them.
- We will keep to a minimum any discussion about the applicants until our scheduled Sunday pm discussion where we will discuss all the applicants and determine who we want to recommend. They then become candidates.
- We will then assign follow-up activities for reference checks on the candidates in preparation for the August 21st meeting.
- We will also talk about the final report presentation where we will all be present September 5th. This will also include Board training and helping them determine how they will include community input on their finalist. Their meetings start at 5:30. Board meeting first and then closed session. Training takes place in public session. Usually it takes 1 ½ to 2 hours for the presentation and training. They will receive sample documents before hand - questions for interviews 1 and 2, review of calendar, assignments of hosts/hostesses etc.

Question Suggestions:

A. Give a brief bio and synopsis of your professional career.

1. Briefly discuss 3-4 attributes that make you the best person to lead Columbus City Schools.
2. What will you do to develop positive relationships with school board members? Describe the Superintendent/Board relationship with which you strive to work.
3. What you will do to develop positive relationships with local elected officials? With the business community? Give us an example of a recent decision you made that involved a collaborative effort.
4. Describe successful instructional initiatives that you led to reduce the achievement gap in a school system with a diverse student population.
5. What experiences do you have in developing capital plans? In proposing changes in school attendance zones?
6. If the school board selects you as its new superintendent, will you move your family to Columbus?
7. What would be your priorities as the new superintendent? Describe your first 100 days.
8. Share your experiences and successes in working in diverse school districts. What do you know about CCS?
9. Is there anything in your background that would be embarrassing for the city and/or for the school system?
10. Columbus City Schools is a large school district. How will you communicate with the various neighborhoods and its residents?
11. What was your worst experience as an administrator? How did you handle it?
12. What would your staff say is your biggest strength? Weakness?
13. What would you like to tell us about your personal life? Your family life?